City of Keene **New Hampshire**

FINANCE, ORGANIZATION AND PERSONNEL COMMITTEE **MEETING MINUTES**

Thursday, May 25, 2017 6:30 PM **Council Chambers**

Members Present:	Staff Present:
Mitchell H. Greenwald, Chair	Medard Kopczynski, City Manager

Don Lussier, City Engineer Carl B. Jacobs, Vice-Chair Mark Howard, Fire Chief

Thomas F. Powers Terry M. Clark Nancy Vincent, Library Director

John Rogers, Acting Health Manager Bettina A, Chadbourne Terri Hood, Assistant City Clerk

Tom Mullins, City Attorney Patty Little, City Clerk **Councilors Present** George Hansel Steve Russo, Police Chief

Gary Lamoureux Dan Langille, City Assessor Jan Manwaring Duncan Watson, Asst. Public Works

Director

Kurt Blomquist, Public Works Director Rebecca Landry, ACM/IT Director **Mayor Kendall Lane** Meghan Spaulding, Recreation Planner

Beth Fox, ACM/ HR Director Steve Thornton, Finance Director

Chair Greenwald called the meeting to order at 6:30 PM.

1) Acceptance of Donations – Fire Department

Mark Howard, Fire Chief said the Keene Fire Department has received donations from Audrey and Russell Starkey (\$50.00), the Harold Larro Living Trust (\$75.00), David and Carolyn Eno (\$35.00), and Robert and Cynthia King (\$20.00) in memory of Doris Dinkle.

Councilor Clark made the following motion which was seconded by Councilor Powers.

On 5-0 vote, the Finance, Organization and Personnel recommend that the City Manager be authorized to do all things necessary to accept four donations totaling \$180.00.

2) Acceptance of Donation - Parks, Recreation and Facilities **Department**

Meghan Spaulding, Recreation Planner said the Recreation Department held their annual Activity Night on Friday, May 12, 2017 for middle school students. This is their annual fundraiser for our Summer Scholarship Program that benefits local families to send

their children to summer camp or the after school program.

Councilor Powers made the following motion which was seconded by Councilor Clark.

On 5-0 vote, the Finance, Organization and Personnel Committee recommends that the City Manager be authorized to do all things necessary to accept a donation of \$2,021.20 and that the money be used for the Recreation Department summer playground scholarship fund.

3) <u>Light Emitting Diode Streetlight Vendor Selection- Public Works Department</u> Duncan Watson, Assistant Public Works Director said he was here tonight to recommend a vendor for the LED streetlights project. He made reference to the demonstration held last fall along Marlboro Street for which public opinion was solicited. While this demonstration was ongoing they began to assemble an RFP to convert 1,155 streetlights from high pressure sodium lights to LED lights. This project was, in part, based on an incentive program created by Eversource that would help to fund some of the capital costs for this project. The public opinion received was highly favorable. In addition to better quality lighting, this conversion will also cut the energy costs in half. Based on the results of the interviews and evaluation of the RFP's staff is recommending the selection of Affinity Lighting, out of Dover, New Hampshire.

Mr. Watson continued part of the reason for selecting Affinity Lighting is because their pricing was very competitive, and the bulbs are actually assembled in Dover. The warranty is with the company and not transferred to a lighting supplier. Mr. Watson explained the "L" rating noting Affinity's bulbs have a life-cycle of 62 years. With the incentive program created by Eversource they can expect a payback on the program in about two years. Mr. Watson recommended leaving the street lighting budget the way it is for a while; until they see the bill payoff. Mr. Watson said the project would begin after July 1st.

Councilor Powers clarified Affinity Lighting would be the vendor and they would hire a subcontractor for the installation. Mr. Watson replied in the affirmative noting they have partnered with Hamlett Electric to do the installation of the cobra head fixture.

Councilor Clark pointed out they City buys their electricity from First Point Power, LLC but this says they City will get a discount from Eversource. Mr. Watson agreed noting the First Point contract runs through 2018. Councilor Clark asked if this would affect the First Point contract. Kurt Blomquist, Public Works Director explained the specific accounts noting they pay Eversource on a per fixture basis for the streetlights. Mr. Watson added they base their cost on the fixture wattage (unmetered); so dropping the wattage down will save money. Mr. Watson also said they are looking into whether or not they actually pay First Point for the electricity used for the streetlights. Public Works Director reported that although Eversource has a cost per fixture; the street lights are not metered. Even though there is another provider for the electricity, it does not affect the street light account.

Councilor Jacobs made the following motion which was seconded by Councilor Clark.

On 5-0 vote, the Finance, Organization and Personnel Committee recommends the City Manager be authorized to do all things necessary to contract with Affinity LED Lighting to supply and install up to one thousand one hundred fifty five (1,155) light emitting diode (LED) streetlights in the City of Keene for a total estimated cost of \$261,982 to be funded by the approved FY18-23 Capital Improvement Program budget.

Further, that the Finance, Organization and Personnel Committee recommends the City Manager be authorized to do all things necessary to accept and execute available rebates for the installation of LED streetlights up to \$100,000 from Eversource.

4) Capital Purchase – Asphalt Reclaimer - Public Works Department

Duncan Watson, Assistant Public Works Director said The Highway Division is recommending the purchase of an asphalt reclaimer to repair small pavement deficiencies throughout the City of Keene. This piece of equipment turns chunk asphalt and/or asphalt millings into a high quality recycled product. This material, generally a waste product, comes from city construction projects and is stored at 560 Main Street. An asphalt reclaimer will be particularly useful during the winter months as the facility for hot-mix asphalt closes from November through April.

Mr. Watson continued winter time can be problematic for the Highway Division to maintain streets that have potholes or for the Water & Sewer Division when repairing trenches. The asphalt reclaimer makes a product using waste material and a rejuvenator to create a product that will be vastly superior to cold patch during the winter months, and is a product that can be used for small pavement repairs year-round. The greatest benefit of the hot-mix from an asphalt reclaimer is that it negates the need to revisit locations that were temporarily filled with cold patch. The hot-mix is a one-time permanent repair that will provide the traveling public with an improved experience, and it will save money. Mr. Watson said the Department proposes to use unspent personnel funds and unspent capital road rehabilitation project funds to cover the cost for the equipment. Mr. Watson recommended moving forward with this request.

Chair Greenwald asked if this product would adhere in the winter. Mr. Watson replied in the affirmative and explained the rejuvenation process noting it is as effective as putting hot mix down. Chair Greenwald pointed out the cost difference of the hot mix at \$78.00 per ton and this proposed mix at \$10.00 per ton. Mr. Watson also indicated the existing staff would be able to perform any necessary repairs to this piece of equipment.

Mr. Watson clarified the operational process for Councilor Powers. Councilor Powers noted the work load at Public Works and asked how they will keep ahead of all the things they have to do. Mr. Watson explained this will save time and money as some spots are cold-patched several times per day; this would provide the Department the ability to repair the spot only one time. Councilor Powers also noted he thinks this is a good project but he is concerned with using personnel funds for operations. For this reason Councilor Powers said he could not support the recommended motion.

Councilor Chadbourne made the following motion which was seconded by Councilor Jacobs.

On 4-1 vote, the Finance, Organization and Personnel Committee recommends that the City Manager be authorized to do all things necessary to purchase a KM T2 asphalt reclaimer from Pavement Maintenance Supply of Millbury, MA (through a State bid process), for an amount not to exceed \$80,153 and further that the City Council authorize the use of up to \$21,000 of unspent FY 17 personnel funds from the Public Works Department Operating budget and that staff submit the necessary Resolution to designate up to \$60,000 from the project balance of the FY15 Road Rehabilitation Project Account, 90249 for this purchase. Councilor Powers voted in opposition.

5) Rt. 12/Main Street Bridge over Beavor Brook – Public Works Department
Don Lussier, City Engineer reported that in September 2014, the City awarded an
engineering design contract to the Louis Berger Group, Inc. (LBG) on a qualificationbased selection process. LBG has now completed the design work for the bridge in a
satisfactory manner. They expect to receive authorization to advertise the project from
the New Hampshire Departments of Transportation (NHDOT) within the next two weeks.
Construction is expected to begin by the end of July and to continue through the fall.

Mr. Lussier continued City Code requires that professional services contracts over \$25,000 be entered into after receiving proposals from various interested firms and approval by the City Council. Public Works recommends that the contract for construction-phase engineering services be awarded to LBG on a "sole source" basis. As the project engineer, LBG is uniquely qualified to oversee the construction work and ensure that their design intent is carried out.

Mr. Lussier clarified for Councilor Jacobs that LBG was hired in 2014 to do the preliminary design based on qualifications which is required when using Federal funds for a project.

Councilor Clark made the following motion which was seconded by Councilor Powers.

On 5-0 vote, the Finance, Organization and Personnel Committee recommends that the City Manager be authorized to do all things necessary to negotiate and execute a professional engineering services contract with the Louis Berger Group, Inc. of Manchester, NH for the construction phase of the Rt. 12/Main Street over Beaver Brook (90151-A) for an amount not to exceed \$220,200.

6) <u>Babbidge Reservoir Dam Improvements Project – Public Works Department</u>
Don Lussier, City Engineer said this is the same issue as the previous agenda item. In
June 2014, the City awarded an engineering design contract to Dubois & King, Inc. on a
qualification and fee-based selection process. Dubois & King has now completed the
design work in a satisfactory manner. The project was advertised for construction in early

May. Construction is expected to begin by the end of June and to continue through the fall.

Mr. Lussier continued City Code requires that professional services contracts over \$25,000 be entered into after receiving proposals from various interested firms and approval by the City Council. Public Works recommends that the contract for construction-phase engineering services be awarded to Dubois & King on a "sole source" basis. The fee proposal from Dubois & King is reasonable. They have a vested interest in the success of this project and will be an advocate to advance the project through successful construction.

Councilor Powers made the following motion which was seconded by Councilor Jacobs.

On 5-0 vote, the Finance, Organization and Personnel Committee recommends that the City Manager be authorized to do all things necessary to negotiate and execute a professional engineering services contract with Dubois & King, Inc. of Randolph, VT for the construction phase of the Babbidge Reservoir Dam Improvements Project (05034-B) for an amount not to exceed \$139,356.00.

7) <u>Underground Telecommunications Conduit Contract – IT Department</u>

Rebecca Landry, ACM/IT Director said excavation and surface restoration has become possible due to the planned installation of conduit by Eversource to support their new transformer equipment. Staff learned of this project after the FY17 budget was adopted. The IT Department staff and Public Works Engineering have been meeting with Eversource representatives to review planned activities and schedules. The Economic Development Action Plan supports the installation of conduit for the purpose of expanding broadband access for businesses. Eversource's ongoing work in the downtown represents a unique opportunity to advance this goal. Doing so will require the City to acquire easements from private landowners for which the Planning, Licenses and Development Committee has authorized the City Manager to negotiate and execute said easements.

Ms. Landry continued the next step is to identify a funding source and contract for the materials. Eversource has contracted with LJM Construction, LLC for the excavation work and materials. It is, therefore, recommended that the City use LJM Construction as a sole source provider for the materials and services required for the City conduit. This approach will allow us to install conduits without the normal cost of trench excavation, backfill and pavement. Public Works anticipates available funds in cost center 02010-62331 "Street Maintenance." Staff recommends moving forward with LJM Construction as a sole source provider for the project and that 02010-62311 be identified as the funding source up to \$30,000.

Chair Greenwald noted there is a likelihood this conduit may cross some of his property. He clarified he will be receiving no money, or broadband connections. The only thing happening is there will be pipe installed on property he owns. Ms. Landry added this benefits the community as a whole.

Medard Kopczynski, City Manager noted the relationship developing between Public Works and the IT Department deserves mentioning.

Councilor Jacobs made the following motion which was seconded by Councilor Powers.

On 5-0 vote, the Finance, Organization and Personnel Committee recommends that the City Manager be authorized to do all things necessary to negotiate and execute a contract for the installation of communication conduit and related materials with LJM Construction, LLC as a sole source provider. Funding for the project is to come from the reallocation of operating funds from Public Works Road and Street Maintenance budget, 02010-62331.

8) Relating to Class Allocation and Salary Schedules Ordinance O-2017-07

Beth Fox, ACM/HR Director said she is here to provide an update to the cost allocation and salary schedule; Chapter 2 and 62 of the City Code. She reminded the Committee there is currently an assessment of these codes in progress. This is a significant project to staff and the Council. It is important to our future as they seek to efficiently provide services to the community, and retain and recruit highly skilled workers. Ms. Fox noted she would be talking about adjustments to the current class allocation and salary schedule and thought it was useful to remind everyone they have a lot of work to do on this subject.

Ms. Fox continued the updates include a cost of living adjustment and in the context of the existing class allocation system, continuation of some work they began last year considering compression, and market conditions. The City's workforce is comprised of 283 full-time regular employees; 195 of those positions are part of a bargaining unit. She said 85 full and part-time employees are not unionized and are included in the ordinance under discussion. Ms. Fox reported the following information.

The ordinance provides a wage adjustment that is comparable and aligns with the COLA provided by ratified union contracts, which are between 2 and 2.5 percent. There are a few union contracts still under negotiation. This COLA adjustment follows a five-year period where non-union wage adjustments have generally averaged less than 2% a year. The adjustments this year are recommended to maintain these wage schedules in what is now becoming an increasingly competitive wage market. Ms. Fox noted as of April 2017 the unemployment rate for Keene (2.5%) is below the State rate (2.8%), below the New England rate of 3.9 percent, and the national rate of 4.4 percent. Ms. Fox discussed the Workforce Challenges session put on the by the Chamber of Commerce yesterday.

They are working in an extremely competitive labor market and sometimes they struggle with recruitment particularly for certain types of positions. Ms. Fox referred to the metrics noting 30 percent of their workforce is eligible for retirement; though not all are retiring in the near future. Over time they are going

to have to replace these skilled workers. Addressing the other adjustments Ms. Fox advised she would walk through the schedules page by page.

Ms. Fox referred to Page 3 of 7 which reflects City Code Section 2-231 Council Appointments explaining this represents the application of the 2 percent COLA. Referring to Page 4 of 7, City Code Section 62-166 Probationary Public Works Schedule Ms. Fox explained this does not reflect an adjustment. This will be the final year they need to do that and allow all these steps to be useful under their current contract with non-probationary employees.

Referring to Page 5 of 7, City Code Section 62-191Probationary Firefighter which deals with the first year a firefighter comes into the organization.

- Levels F1 and F2 reflect a 2 percent adjustment
- Level F3 has a slight premium of 2.25 percent. This recognizes if they can bring higher leveled skilled employees into the workforce they have a greater opportunity for potential for training in the future.

Also on Page 5 of 7, City Code 62-192 Probationary Police Officer the Ordinance reflects also reflects a 2.63 percent adjustment for new hires to the Police Department. This adjustment mirrors the contract adjustment for Police personnel in the previous year.

Ms. Fox said the final schedules, Pages 6-7 of Administrative and Clerical also reflects a 2 percent COLA adjustment. It also includes several other adjustments. Two deletions are proposed: a S18, Engineering Utilities Inspection Coordinator along with a S20, Assistant Attorney's position. These are being addressed by other organization and budget efforts. The other adjustments on this schedule are efforts to "move the ball" on compression. The Ordinance reflects the insertion of two half steps; one between S24 and S25 with the second between S27 and S28. This would move the public safety positions of Police Captain and Deputy Fire Chief to the S24.5 level. The Police Chief, Fire Chief, and Public Works Director would move to the S27.5 level. Finally if these positions acquire a Department Head designation the City Code provides for a two- step increment, and under the proposed Ordinance this would be accommodated at a S29.5 level. Ms. Fox concluded by noting she would be happy to answer any questions.

Councilor Powers clarified they are mostly talking about the compression issue and those positions in public safety. Although he appreciates the fact they are being addressed he is not comfortable with the way it is being done. He said they have a great, solid step plan that needs to be adjusted from time to time for its economic value; but by adding half steps they have only gone half way. Referring to the positions affected, Councilor Powers explained the issue was recognized in 1999 and the performance bonus came about in 2004. The performance bonus' value is almost that of a step in the program.

Councilor Jacobs said he would be interested in hearing Councilor Powers' proposal. The City Manager commented he recognizes the fact they are trying to move down the road a little bit. He explained he is not afraid to take the full bite noting there is a cost to that too. The other side of that is they have spent a bit of time trying to prepare the Council for a lot of organizational discussion that needs to take place. He noted the three "R's" rooted out in yesterday's discussion recruit, retain, and retrain; recognizing that recruit is becoming a bit harder. They are finding it more and more difficult to have an internal cadre interested in moving up because of the differences in workweeks, benefits, and the ability to earn overtime. The adjustment Councilor Powers is talking about is long overdue and well deserved.

George Hansel, City Councilor asked if the alternative Councilor Power's is mentioning is a performance incentive as opposed to the half steps for those two positons. Councilor Powers said if he were to amend the proposed ordinance his proposal would be to go from a half step to a full step for each of the categories mentioned. After the affected employees have earned their performance bonus it would go away. He continued it is not two forms of remuneration; it will ultimately be one. What that means in economics is a little more in the first year because some people have earned a certain amount of money and then you implement the step. In the long run it comes out to be pretty close to what is going on now. This would keep the system consistent recognizing the issue of compression. He also noted there are only five or six employees that have this particular style of performance bonus.

Chair Greenwald asked the City Manager if this issue needs to be done now. He suggested a workup of the costs of Councilor Powers' proposal would be helpful. The City Manager replied they have already prepared that. Ms. Fox said looking at it as a net/net the transitionary costs is a little difficult because they have employees who over the next one to seven months are due performance bonuses. The cost for the full staff program with benefit load is \$37, 460. That savings when they come out the end of the performance bonus system is \$26, 625. Ms. Fox continued they will have an increased cost as they work their way out of it.

Chair Greenwald asked Ms. Fox for staff's recommendation on Councilor Powers' amendment. Ms. Fox explained her rationale for not doing it as Councilor Powers is suggesting. She agreed Councilor Powers' proposal is doable and added she knew it would be more difficult to explain. Councilor Jacobs asked if the \$37,460 was the cost for the entire six people. Ms. Fox replied in the affirmative.

Councilor Chadbourne asked if the operating budget would have to be increased by the \$37,460. Ms. Fox replied in the negative, noting the budget increase would be \$18,990. Ms. Fox explained more cash would be needed during the transition period and less cash at the other side. Steve Thornton, Finance Director added

there would be no need to amend the budget as they have included amounts for COLA and compression. Mr. Thornton clarified there would be no additional action towards the budget required for either proposal.

Chair Greenwald asked the Finance Director to explain compression which he did. Chair Greenwald then clarified the issue is how to incentive going from an hourly employee to a salaried employee.

Councilor Clark wanted to know when there has been a problem filling these positions. Chair Greenwald said it is a problem; it's a cut in pay and they are asking people to do more as supervisors.

Councilor Hansel commented he is wary about letting the performance bonus system go away for these positions. He added they want "go-getters" in these positions.

Gary Lamoureux, City Councilor referred to Ms. Fox's half step proposal and asked the following: 1) does this bring us out of compression, and 2) if it does how long will that last and what are the next steps. Ms. Fox replied from a market position in the short-term it has a larger impact on the immediate question of compression. In the long-term they will have to continually monitor this. She added there is probably no one time solution to make this problem go away forever. Councilor Lamoureux commented on this long standing problem and suggested he would be in favor of the a step increase, is unsure about the performance bonus process, and does not support the half step increases.

Councilor Jacobs commented he is not sure what the performance bonus is exactly but his sense of how this system works is you move to the next step based upon some sort evaluation by your superiors. Ms. Fox explained the six step system and how it works for those employees with tenure. The City Manager addressed the merit based performance system and his comments in the supplementary budget document. He cited the six employees from Public Works who figured out how to save the City six million dollars as the type of effort they should be rewarding.

Councilor Chadbourne made the following motioned to recommend adoption of Ordinance O-2017-07. Councilor Jacobs seconded the motion.

Councilor Powers moved to amend Ordinance O-2017-07 by striking S24.5, S27.5, and S29.5 in the Administrative and Clerical Annual Salary Schedule and in its place further amend by placing the positions of Police Captain and Deputy Fire Chief in the S25 classification; in addition place the positions of Police Chief, Fire Chief, and Public Works Director in the S28 classification; and to prepare an ordinance to change the City Code Section 62-195 (Performance Bonus for Public Safety Personnel) by removing it from the Code following the transition of personnel to the revised plan. Councilor Clark seconded the motion to amend.

On a vote of 3-2 the amendment carried. Councilors Clark and Chadbourne voted in opposition.

Thomas Mullins, City Attorney noted his recommendation would be to request staff to submit an ordinance to that affect. This gives the Council an opportunity to review the language and it places the issue on a public agenda.

Councilor Jacobs asked if two things were being mixed together; he asked if the first part would have a budget impact to which Chair Greenwald replied in the negative. Chair Greenwald noting his understanding is it takes the change to what is in front of us, as well as the proposed change to the Code to financially make this flow. Councilor Jacobs asked if the performance bonus is something an employee gets when they reach the top step. Ms. Fox explained the performance bonus applies to certain public safety positions with a satisfactory review regardless of any step increase. The amount has been adjusted over the years to try to stay ahead of compression. Ms. Fox added to make it more confusing City Code goes by the hiring date.

Ms. Fox asked if it were possible to separate the two; Attorney Mullins commented he thinks that is what they are proposing.

Jan Manwaring, Councilor Ward 1 noted her confusion and suggested this be put on more time so all of the City Councilors can get up to speed. Chair Greenwald wanted to know the implications of holding the Ordinance. The City Manager commented he would not hold the raises for the non-union employees. The City Manager continued you could hold the discussion on movement to different grades for certain positions.

Chair Greenwald, Councilor Jacobs, and Councilor Powers provided their rationale for supporting the amendment. Councilor Chadbourne noted her discomfort in supporting the amendment due to her not fully understanding the system. The City Manager said if the amendment succeeds he will work with the Human Resources Director to put together a positon paper for Council next week.

On 4-1 vote, the Finance, Organization and Personnel Committee recommend the adoption of Ordinance O-2017-07 as amended. Councilor Chadbourne voted in opposition.

9) Relating to Personnel Procedures – Hours of Work – Finance Department
Beth Fox, ACM/HR Director reported the City Code and collective bargaining
agreements, augmented by the Employee Handbook, provide an employment framework
for management of the City's workforce. Chapter 62-216 prescribes hours of work for
various types of positions and departments. An analysis of the City work week practice
indicates that an adjustment modifying the basic work week to 40 hours for certified fire
department positions listed in Chapter 62-194 (Fire Chief and Deputy Fire Chief) aligns
the City's standard for those positions to comparable communities and to similar
positions on the City's schedule. Ms. Fox noted because of the shift cycles the Fire
Department has a 42 hour work week. The recommended change does not affect

probationary/shift firefighters. It only impacts a few employees, creating a fair work schedule.

Councilor Powers commented he does not feel this is necessary, but as the HR Director has reminded us this evening there is language in the Code that needs review; he added cleaning the language up is a good thing. Councilor Powers also noted it was never intended that they work 42 hour weeks. He did urge Councilors to pass this with the understanding more is coming in the future.

Councilor Clark asked when full-time stopped being 40 hours a week. Ms. Fox noted under federal law there are varying work week requirements for public safety employees.

Councilor Powers made the following motion which was seconded by Councilor Jacobs.

On 5-0 vote, the Finance, Organization and Personnel Committee recommend the adoption of Ordinance O-2017-08.

10) FY 2017-2018 Proposed Budget – Staff Recommended Change – Finance Department

Chair Greenwald advised as a public hearing has been held no additional public comments will be accepted.

Steve Thornton, Finance Director reported during preparation of the FY 18 Operating Budget an item was not included, and it should have been. The City Clerk did discuss this at her FOP Budget hearing. His memorandum is asking that the budget be adjusted to include the \$17,165 for the purpose of voting booths for Ward 1.

Noting the proposed budget is at 1.99 percent tax increase Councilor Chadbourne asked how this affects that percentage. Mr. Thornton replied it would be approximately 2.06 percent. Councilor Chadbourne asked if it were possible to reduce something else in that department to keep it under 2.0 percent. Mr. Thornton suggested the City Clerk would have to answer that question.

Chair Greenwald made the following motion which was seconded by Councilor Powers.

On 5-0 vote, the Finance, Organization and Personnel Committee recommend the memorandum from the Finance Director on a budget adjustment be accepted as informational.

11) <u>Relating to the Fiscal Year 2017-2018 Operating Budget – Resolution R-2017-22</u> Chair Greenwald moved for the adoption of Resolution R-2017-22 as presented. Councilor Jacobs seconded the motion.

Chair Greenwald noted now is the time for discussion and amendments.

Councilor Clark referred to Page 45, line 62142 Transporting. Councilor Clark then moved to add \$1,000.00 to this line. Councilor Powers seconded the motion.

On a 4-1 vote the motion failed. Chair Greenwald, Councilor Powers, Councilor Jacobs, and Councilor Chadbourne voted in opposition.

Councilor Clark suggested public transportation is going to be much more important than they think it is. He would like to see more money added here for advertising to let our citizens know they have this service. Councilor Powers commented they asked the City Manager to bring the budget in at a certain level and it was done; they need to be consistent and follow the guidelines they have put forth. Councilor Jacobs agreed with Councilor Powers. Councilor Chadbourne noted the efforts put into the budget and her desire to see the increase kept under or at a 2 percent property tax increase. The City Manager addressed the process utilized by an internal committee that evaluates Outside Agency applications submitted. Chair Greenwald said they have a responsibility to stand behind the process and that will be his vote.

Councilor Clark motioned to add \$8,000.00 to line 62136 Keene Community Kitchen, on Page 45. There being no second the motion failed.

Councilor Jacobs referred to Page 46, line 61316 Community Events Wages. Councilor Jacobs noted the Red Cap Run was designated as a Community Event adding this line needs to be increased to account for Police Department overtime.

Councilor Jacobs moved to increase line 61316 Community Events Wages by \$591.12 for the Red Cap Run. Councilor Powers seconded the motion.

Steve Thornton, Finance Director clarified this line takes in any wages from the Police, Fire Department, or Public Works for Community Events. Councilor Chadbourne asked how this affects the 1.99 percent. Mr. Thornton replied he did not know and that this amount could probably be found elsewhere in the budget. Chair Greenwald noted the budget for this line item reflected \$25,000 and this would add \$591.12 to that line item. Councilor Powers noted the Finance Director said he could find this money elsewhere without increasing property taxes. The Finance Director suggested the additional funds would come from the Finance Department Office Supplies budget. The Finance Director also recommended the motion be made as it clarified the spending authorization.

On a 5-0 vote the amendment to add \$591.12 to line 61316 Community Events Wages for the Red Cap Run carried.

Chair Greenwald addressed the voting booths (\$17,165) which was discussed earlier, noting this was omitted from the budget book. He noted this memorandum addresses the \$17,165 needed to replace the voting booths in Ward 1.

Chair Greenwald moved to add \$17,165 to the City Clerk's line 62734 Minor Equipment and that the funds come from cost center 00400 Assessing, line item Property Tax, account 41105. Councilor Powers seconded the motion.

Councilor Chadbourne commented she could not support this request as it will take the budget over the 2 percent. She also suggested perhaps this could wait a year. Councilor Clark commented he thinks this is needed. Chair Greenwald commented he also thinks this is needed; he added had this not been an oversight it would have been in the budget.

On a 4-1 vote the amendment carried. Councilor Chadbourne voted in opposition.

Councilor Clark referred to Page 49, line 62605 Parking Space Rental and asked if this was a collective bargaining item. The Finance Director replied it is in at least one case. Councilor Clark then how much of the appropriation was a benefit of a collective bargaining contract? The Finance Director replied \$5,720. Chair Greenwald explained this is more or less an employee benefit and \$40,040 goes from the General Fund into the Parking Fund.

Councilor Clark motioned to reduce line 62605 Parking Space Rental by \$34,320 excluding the \$5,720 which is contractual. Councilor Jacobs seconded the motion.

Chair Greenwald asked how many employees were involved in this. The Finance Director reported a total of 77 spaces; 11 through a contract agreement and 66 employees. Councilor Powers noted this would reduce the Parking Fund revenue. Councilor Clark shared his rationale noting taxpayers who work downtown have to pay for their own parking. He indicated this is about fairness to the taxpayers. Councilor Jacobs said he is not inclined to take something away from employees. He seconded the motion to allow for discussion. Councilor Jacobs shares Councilor Chadbourne's concerns about the budget and is not likely to support this amendment. Chair Greenwald commented this makes the assumption that the employee parking spaces would otherwise be paid for by shoppers; he is not convinced that is the case. Councilor Clark said he did not make the same assumption. He also noted they just heard from the Parking Department that their revenue was down. The City Manager listed the parking lots under discussion, City Hall, the Library, and Wells Street; he added the employees they are talking about are primarily from the Library and City Hall. This would not affect the Fire Department, Police Department, or Public Works. The City Manager pointed out there are employers in the downtown that provide parking. They estimate the costs to City Hall and Library employees to be approximately \$520 a year.

On a vote of 4-1 the amendment to line 62605 Parking Space Rental failed. Chair Greenwald, Councilor Powers, Councilor Jacobs, and Councilor Chadbourne voted in opposition.

On a 4-1 vote Resolution R-2017-22 carried as amended.

Councilor Powers commented favorably on the budget and made reference to the Supplemental message submitted by the City Manager noting he now takes this as a challenge. Councilor Powers noted the same topic put forth by the City Manager was first introduced in 1989. Councilor Powers challenged the FOP Committee to focus on this issue after July 1st to meet the challenges of the next generation. He thanked the City Manager for his great work.

12) Relating to the Appropriation of Funds for the Consolidated Infrastructure Project – Relating to the Appropriation of Funds for the LED Streetlights Project; Relating to the Appropriation of Funds for the Flood Management Project; Relating to the Appropriation of Funds for the Airport Terminal Improvement Project and Relating to the Appropriation of Funds for the Transfer Station Energy Source Project

Resolution R-2017-12 Resolution R-2017-13 Resolution R-2017-14 Resolution R-2017-15 Resolution R-2017-16

Councilor Clark made the following motion which was seconded by Councilor Powers.

On 5-0 vote, the Finance, Organization and Personnel Committee recommend adoption of Resolution R-2017-12.

Councilor Powers made the following motion which was seconded by Councilor Clark.

On 5-0 vote, the Finance, Organization and Personnel Committee recommend adoption of Resolution R-2017-13.

Councilor Jacobs made the following motion which was seconded by Councilor Powers.

On 5-0 vote, the Finance, Organization and Personnel Committee recommend adoption of Resolution R-2017-14.

Councilor Chadbourne made the following motion which was seconded by Councilor Jacobs.

On 5-0 vote, the Finance, Organization and Personnel Committee recommend adoption of Resolution R-2017-15.

Councilor Clark made the following motion which was seconded by Councilor Powers.

On 5-0 vote, the Finance, Organization and Personnel Committee recommend adoption of Resolution R-2017-16.

13) Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 8:35 pm.

Respectfully submitted by, Mary Lou Sheats-Hall, Minute Taker May 27, 2017